

Evaluation of Options for Modernisation of Services in Teignmouth and Dawlish

1. Introduction

As part of the modernisation of health and care services in the Teignmouth and Dawlish area, an evaluation of the options has been undertaken to ensure all options have been considered and all factors have been taken into account prior to recommending options for public consultation. The options and criteria have been developed through collaborative working that has been undertaken with partners over the last two years, feedback from public engagement and key stakeholders, and taking into account the key reasons for change.

The vision for Teignmouth and Dawlish is to provide excellent integrated services:

- To build on the success so far of integrating services by bringing a range of local services together under one roof in a new Health and Wellbeing Centre in Teignmouth
- To ensure the sustainability of primary care in Teignmouth
- To help people stay well and support them when they need help
- To enable people to stay at home for as long as possible

2. Options

a) Health and Wellbeing Centre

The Health and Wellbeing Centre will house Teignmouth's biggest practice, Channel View Medical Group, the health and wellbeing team, Volunteering in Health and possibly a pharmacy. Through a site appraisal process, seven sites for the new centre were identified as having potential to meet the required criteria for a health and wellbeing centre. Partners involved in this process included patient representatives, GPs and representatives from Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust and the former South Devon and Torbay CCG.

Seven options were considered for the site for the Health and Wellbeing Centre:

- Brunswick Street
- Teignmouth Community Hospital full site
- Broadmeadow Lane
- Teignmouth Community Hospital half site
- Eastcliffe car park
- Quay Road car park
- Rugby Club Site

b) Community clinics

The Coastal Engagement Group comprising representatives from patient participation groups, Teignmouth and Dawlish Community Hospitals' Leagues of Friends, voluntary sector groups, Devon County Council, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust and Devon Clinical Commissioning Group developed a list of options for community clinics. These focussed on the high-use clinics that are currently provided from Teignmouth Community Hospital and include physiotherapy, podiatry and audiology. There is a commitment to maintain current levels of clinic activity.

Three options were identified for the location of these clinics:

- Health and Wellbeing Centre
- Existing Teignmouth Community Hospital
- New build on Teignmouth Community Hospital Site

c) Specialist outpatient clinics

The Coastal Engagement Group (see membership above) developed a list of options for specialist outpatient clinics. These are less frequently attended clinics, usually provided by a consultant. There is a commitment to maintain current levels of clinics activity.

Five options were identified for the location of these clinics:

- Dawlish Community Hospital
- Existing Teignmouth Community Hospital
- New build on Teignmouth Community Hospital site
- Newton Abbot Community Hospital
- Torbay Hospital

d) Day case procedures

The Coastal Engagement Group developed a list of options for day case procedures. Day case procedures are minor procedures undertaken by a specialist that require a surgical and recovery space. These procedures are undertaken in a treatment room and include only those procedures where a local anaesthetic is required. There is a commitment to deliver current levels of activity.

Five options were identified for the location of these clinics:

- Dawlish Community Hospital
- Existing Teignmouth Community Hospital

- New build on Teignmouth Community Hospital site
- Newton Abbot Community Hospital
- Torbay Hospital

e) Rehabilitation beds

The Coastal Engagement Group developed a list of options for rehabilitation services. During a previous consultation it was proposed that the medical beds at Teignmouth Community Hospital were re-designated as therapy-led rehabilitation beds and a plan was developed to deliver these. However, during the development time, the introduction of the enhanced intermediate care team and its tangible success meant the CCG decided to review the need for the beds.

Two options were identified for the rehabilitation services:

- Implement rehabilitation/non-medical beds in Teignmouth Community Hospital
- Continue with the model of community-based enhanced intermediate care

3. Criteria

a) Health and Wellbeing Centre

The site appraisal stakeholder group including patient, GP, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust and the former South Devon and Torbay CCG representatives drew up a list of 10 criteria to evaluate each site option. Each criterion was weighted against its importance to the delivery of the Health and Wellbeing Centre. The criteria used to evaluate the potential options for the site of the health and wellbeing centre included:

- Site area - is the site large enough to accommodate the proposed facilities? Is a degree of design compromise required?
- Parking - is there space on the site for adequate parking or is sufficient parking available nearby?
- Public transport - is public transport available nearby to and from the site?
- Access- is suitable and safe vehicular and pedestrian access available?
- Abnormal costs - are there abnormal costs associated with the site?
- Deliverability - is the building deliverable, ie considering ownership, legal issues, planning issues, surrounding and existing land use, site constraints, trees/landscape?
- Development timeframe - are there issues which would elongate the development timeframe
- Future proofing - do the site characteristics allow for future proofing/expansion, eg ease of extension and planning consents?
- Demography/geography - how close is the site to the town centre, centres of population and areas of deprivation?
- Impact of seasonal traffic - will access to the site be unduly affected by seasonal traffic?

The weighting given to each criterion is outlined below:

Criterion	Weighting	Numerical Weighting
Site area	High	5
Parking	Medium	4
Public transport	Medium/High	4
Access	Medium	3
Abnormal costs	High	5
Deliverability	High	5
Development timeframe	High	5
Future proofing	Medium	4
Demography/geography	Medium/Low	1
Impact of seasonal traffic	Low	1

A desktop transport analysis was undertaken by independent environmental impact consultants WSP on behalf of Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust in December 2017, to assess the transport conditions on four of the proposed sites: Broadmeadow Lane, Eastcliffe car park, Brunswick Street, and Mill Lane (existing Teignmouth Community Hospital site).

The assessment consisted of reviewing and scoring each site based on four criteria, being;

- Access: review of existing pedestrian, cycle and vehicular access arrangements and scope for providing new access if existing access does not exist.

- Parking: consider the potential for any off-site parking surrounding the site
- Traffic Impact (including summer peak period): the traffic impact of the proposed site on the local highway network
- Public transport: review current public transport provision and access routes.

b) Community clinics, specialist outpatient, day case procedures criteria

An Options Evaluation stakeholder group was formed supported by Teignbridge Community and Voluntary Services (CVS). Teignbridge CVS invited members of its Voluntary Sector Forum and Community Grants panel to take part in the process. Devon CCG worked with the stakeholder group to determine the criteria to be used to evaluate the options and the weighting to be given to each criterion.

The criteria selected to be used to evaluate the options for community clinics, specialist outpatient clinics and day surgery were:

Criterion	Factors to consider	Weighting	Yes/No or score
Space/capacity	• Is the location/site large enough to accommodate the all currently provided services? • Does the location support the commitment to provide services within the Teignmouth and Dawlish locality?		Y/N
Finance	• Is it affordable? • Capital cost required – are there any abnormal costs? • Has funding been identified to deliver?	High	Score
Does it support delivery of the vision for the Coastal area:	• To build on the success so far of integrating services by bringing a range of local services together under one roof in a new Health and Wellbeing Centre in Teignmouth • To ensure the sustainability of primary care in Teignmouth	High	Score

‘Excellent Integrated Services’?	• To help people stay well and support them when they need help • To enable people to stay at home for as long as possible • To optimise use of the purpose-built Dawlish Community Hospital		
Sustainability of service ➤ Service ➤ Population ➤ Building ➤ Staff	• Can the option respond to future changes to service models and population growth? • Is the option in a building that has long term viability? • Is it an attractive proposition for staff?	High	Score
Public transport	• Is public transport available nearby to and from the site?	Medium	Score
Car parking	• Number of disabled spaces (and proximity) • Nearby parking • Cost of parking	Medium	Score
Travel impact	• What is the impact on distance travelled by people using the service?	Medium	Score
Pedestrian access	• Is there easy pedestrian access?	Medium	Score
Impact on local vicinity	• What will be the impact of any additional traffic on the local area? • Will access to the site be unduly affected by seasonal traffic? • What impact will this have on the local economy? • How convenient will it be to access other local services?	Medium	Score

Environmental impact	• What is the environmental impact on the difference in travel arrangements? • Are the buildings environmentally friendly and sustainable?	Low	Score
-----------------------------	---	-----	-------

c) Rehabilitation services criteria

An Options Evaluation stakeholder group was formed supported by Teignbridge CVS. Teignbridge CVS invited members of its Voluntary Sector Forum and Community Grants panel to take part in the process. Devon CCG worked with the stakeholder group to determine the criteria to be used to evaluate the options and the weighting to be given to each criterion.

The criteria selected to be used to evaluate the options for rehabilitation services are:

Criterion	Factors to consider	Weighting	Yes/No or score
Clinical evidence	• NHSE South West Clinical Senate	High	Score
Capacity	• Capacity – number of people per year	High	Score
Finance	• Staffing costs • Capital cost required?	High	Score
Does it support delivery of the vision for the Coastal area: ‘Excellent Integrated Services’ ?	• To build on the success so far of integrating services by bringing a range of local services together under one roof in a new Health and Wellbeing Centre in Teignmouth • To ensure the sustainability of primary care in Teignmouth • To help people stay well and support them when they need help • To enable people to stay at home for as long as possible	High	Score

	To optimise use of purpose-build Dawlish Community Hospital		
--	---	--	--

4. Evaluation

a) Health and Wellbeing Centre

An exercise was undertaken in February 2018 by the site appraisal stakeholder group comprising patient, GP, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust and the former South Devon and Torbay CCG representatives to evaluate the potential options for the site of the Health and Wellbeing Centre.

A desktop transport analysis was undertaken by independent environmental impact consultants WSP on behalf of Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust in December 2017 to assess the transport conditions, on four of the proposed sites: Broadmeadow Lane; Eastcliffe car park; Brunswick Street; Mill Lane (existing Teignmouth Community Hospital site).

The summary outcomes of the stakeholder evaluation and desktop analysis as well as feedback from the public engagement on sites are collated below:

Site	Rationale for proposal/rejection
Brunswick Street	- Site appraisal – low score mainly because the site was considered too small. The site now available has increased in size. - Transport analysis - scored highly in terms of access as both vehicular accesses benefit from the one way system and double-yellow lines on the western side of Brunswick Street providing suitable visibility. Footways are present on both sides of Brunswick Street and street lighting and pedestrian crossings are located along the length of the route to bus stops and Teignmouth Railway Station. - Public engagement: site was suggested by respondents as a suitable site. - Provides the potential for the Health and Wellbeing Centre to be integrated within a planned, whole site, town centre regeneration, with the wider community opportunities of the Health and Wellbeing Centre being part of the Brunswick Street regeneration proposed within the Teignbridge District Council Local Plan. (Brunswick Street had previously been considered as a site option in isolation from the wider development plans.) The 0.88-acre site, which currently contains a 56-

	space car park, two former garages, retail and residential buildings is in a Conservation Area and is allocated for redevelopment in the Local Plan. The site is under-used and partly derelict in places but holds much potential because it is within the heart of the town centre. Teignbridge District Council has assembled parcels of land with the aspiration of reviving the area and has investigated various options for the overall site. PREFERRED OPTION
Teignmouth Community Hospital full site	• Site appraisal: high score – was presented as an option during public engagement. • Transport analysis – the existing hospital site, along Mill Lane, scored poorly in terms of access due to visibility, and thereby not meeting the requirements of the Manual for Street Standards. The site is also located on a steep gradient, making pedestrian and cyclist access unattractive and unsuitable for certain patients. The site is also a fair distance from Teignmouth Railway Station, however, it does benefit from bus stops for both directions being located within 30 metres of the site, and is served by the Teignmouth Town Centre bus service. • Public engagement - Concerns were raised that the Teignmouth Community Hospital site presented a challenge in terms of accessibility, particularly if GP and primary care services were co-located there. • GPs did not support the site as a location for primary care due to accessibility for patients. REJECTED
Broadmeadow Lane	• Site appraisal: low score • Transport analysis - scored the worst mark of all the sites. This is because of the inadequate road layout on the approach, making it unsuitable for vehicles to access the site via Broadmeadow Lane. The change of levels and the electrical substation to the south of the site make it unsuitable to provide a new vehicle access to the A381. REJECTED
Teignmouth Community Hospital half site	• Site appraisal: mid score • Transport analysis– the existing hospital site, along Mill Lane, scored poorly in terms of access due to visibility, thereby not meeting the requirements of the Manual for Street Standards. The site is also located on a steep gradient, making

	pedestrian and cyclist access to the site unattractive and unsuitable for certain patients. The site is also a fair distance from Teignmouth Railway Station, however, it does benefit from bus stops for both directions being located within 30 metres of the site, and is served by the Teignmouth Town Centre bus service. Public engagement - Concerns were raised that the Teignmouth Community Hospital site presented a challenge in terms of accessibility, particularly if GP and primary care services were co-located there. REJECTED
Eastcliffe Car Park	- Site appraisal: high score – was presented as an option during public engagement. - Transport analysis - scored well in terms of access due to the good visibility along Dawlish Road at the vehicle access, and also the pedestrian footway along Dawlish Road leading towards the town centre and public footpath to the east of the site linking to Teignmouth Beach. The site has a high risk transport impact score because of the impact of closing the only long stay car park on the eastern side of Teignmouth. - Public engagement - raised concerns about the loss of parking for visitors and coach parking during the summer months. REJECTED
Quay Road Car Park	Site appraisal: low score REJECTED
Rugby Club Site	Site appraisal: low score REJECTED

Brunswick Street was identified as the preferred option through this process. Torbay and South Devon Foundation NHS Trust has since proceeded with negotiations to buy the site. This does not form part of the consultation.

b) Community clinics, specialist outpatient clinics, day case procedures

The Options Evaluation stakeholder group undertook an evaluation process, scoring the options against each criterion.

Stage 1: The criterion of space/capacity/stays local was applied to the options for community clinics, specialist outpatient clinics and day case procedures as a Yes/No criterion. This criterion was applied to all options in the first instance and only options that scored positively were considered further. Options that did not meet this criterion did not proceed to the second stage of the evaluation.

Stage 2: Those options that passed stage 1 of the evaluation proceeded to stage 2. These were evaluated against each criterion with a score from 1 – 5 (with 1 being that the options do not meet the requirements of the criterion and 5 being that the options fully meet the requirements of the criterion. Each criterion has a weighting applied to it depending on the importance of the criterion to the evaluation. Weighting 1 = low, 2= medium, 3 = high.

Community clinics	Space	Finance	Vision	Sustainable	Public Transport	Parking	Travel	Access	Local	Environment	Total
Health and Wellbeing Centre	Yes	99	102	99	68	58	42	68	56	29	621
Existing Teignmouth Community Hospital	Yes	27	36	24	22	36	34	22	26	13	240
Teignmouth Community Hospital site new build	Yes	18	33	48	22	36	34	22	26	22	261

Specialist Outpatient Clinics	Space	Finance	Vision	Sustainable	Public Transport	Parking	Travel	Access	Local	Environment	Total
Dawlish Community Hospital	Yes	102	96	96	60	62	46	58	46	27	593
Existing Teignmouth Hospital	Yes	33	42	33	32	34	42	30	26	11	283
Teignmouth Hospital site new build	Yes	24	42	60	32	34	42	30	26	13	303
Newton Abbot Community Hospital	No										
Torbay Hospital	No										

Day Case Procedures	Space	Finance	Vision	Sustainable	Public Transport	Parking	Travel	Access	Local	Environment	Total
Dawlish Community Hospital	Yes	96	96	99	60	62	46	58	48	28	593
Existing Teignmouth Community Hospital	Yes	39	36	30	32	34	48	26	32	12	289
Teignmouth Community Hospital site new build	Yes	33	39	57	32	34	48	26	30	18	317
Newton Abbot Community Hospital	No										
Torbay Hospital	No										

c) Rehabilitation Services

The Options Evaluation stakeholder group undertook an evaluation process, scoring the options against each criterion.

Both options were evaluated against each criterion with a score from 1 – 5 (with 1 being that the options do not meet the requirements of the criteria and 5 being that the options fully meet the requirements of the criteria. Each criterion has a weighting applied to it depending on the importance of the criterion to the evaluation. Weighting 1 = low, 2= medium, 3 = high.

Rehabilitation beds	Clinical evidence	Capacity	Finance	Vision	Total
Implement rehabilitation Beds	27	30	33	30	120
Continue with enhanced community model	102	105	102	105	414

5. Decision making

The Teignmouth Steering Group comprising representatives from Devon CCG, Torbay and South Devon NHS Foundation Trust, Teignmouth GPs and Devon County Council analysed the evaluation data and summarised each option as follows:

a) Community Clinics

Site	Rationale for proposal/rejection
Health and Wellbeing Centre	• Access considered good • Keeps services in the Coastal locality • Benefits of co-location with health and wellbeing team, primary care and voluntary sector – supporting the vision of multi-agency working and integration • The current clinics can be ‘lifted and shifted’ • High score in evaluation (621)
Remain within Teignmouth Community Hospital or new build on hospital site	• Teignmouth Community Hospital or a new build would have the capacity for the community clinics to remain with good facilities • Keeps services within the Coastal locality • The building needs extensive renovation and does not have a sustainable future and the cost of a new build is considered high • Keeping the clinics on this site would not achieve the vision of further integration • Access is considered poor • Low score in evaluation (240 and 261)

b) Specialist outpatient clinics

Site	Rationale for proposal/rejection
Dawlish Community Hospital	• Dawlish already has acute outpatient clinics (as well as some community outpatient clinics), but the outpatient clinics are only running at 20% giving capacity for extra activity from Teignmouth • A table-top exercise has been completed with the matrons, and without having to reschedule clinics, the current clinic schedule can be 'lifted and shifted' • Keeps services within the Coastal locality • Access considered good • High score in evaluation (593)
Remain within Teignmouth Community Hospital or new build on hospital site	• Teignmouth Community Hospital has capacity for the outpatient clinics to remain. • Keep services within the Coastal locality • The building needs extensive renovation and does not have a sustainable future and the cost of a new build is considered high • Access is considered poor • Low score in evaluation (283 and 303)
Newton Abbot Community Hospital	• Outpatient facilities do not have the capacity to accommodate this extra activity • Does not keep services within the Coastal locality • Did not pass Stage One of the evaluation process
Torbay Hospital	• Outpatient facilities do not have the capacity to accommodate this extra activity. • Does not keep services within the Coastal locality • Did not pass Stage One of the evaluation process

c) Day Case Procedures

Site	Rationale for proposal/rejection
Dawlish Community Hospital	• Deemed to have potential for expansion and, under a different financial arrangement to that at Newton Abbot Hospital, assessed as an affordable option • Keeps services within the Coastal locality • Access to considered good • High score in evaluation process (593)
Remain within Teignmouth Community Hospital or new build on hospital site	• Teignmouth has capacity for the day case procedures to remain • Keep services within the Coastal locality • The building needs extensive renovation and does not have a sustainable future and the cost of a new build is considered high • Access is considered poor • Low score in evaluation process (289 and 317)
Newton Abbot Community Hospital	• Newton Abbot Hospital does have a day case procedure room and this option was explored to identify whether it could absorb capacity and what changes were required. Capacity is constrained and would require physical expansion to accommodate this service • Does not keep services within the Coastal locality. • Did not pass Stage One of the evaluation process
Torbay Hospital	• There is minimal capacity within the existing unit • Further complicated by the fact that discussions are under way regarding the substantial upgrade required to theatres and the current vulnerability of the existing theatre infrastructure • Would place additional strain and reliance on the Torbay Hospital theatre capacity. • Does not keep services within the Coastal locality • Did not pass Stage One of the evaluation process

d) Rehabilitation Services

Implementing Rehabilitation Beds	• Could reduce the pressure on primary care as requires less medical input into people's own homes although some medical cover would still be required • Teignmouth Community Hospital requires significant investment to be able to provide bed-based care • Does not support the community-based model of care • Low score in the evaluation process (120)
Continue model of community-based intermediate care	• The evidence of the success of the community-based model of care and the intermediate care team • Allows for primary care and GPs to be part of the multi-disciplinary team, developing greater integration • The community-based model of care was supported by South West Clinical Senate, a panel of independent clinicians who reviewed clinical evidence • The intermediate care team cares for approximately 880 people (both in care homes and in their own home) in a year compared with approximately 230 people a year who could be cared for on a bedded rehabilitation ward for about the same cost • Low score in the evaluation process (414)

The Teignmouth Steering Group made the following recommendation to the CCG Governing Body for the proposal for public consultation:

- Move high-use community clinics from Teignmouth Community Hospital to the Health and Wellbeing Centre in Teignmouth
- Move specialist outpatient provision from Teignmouth Community Hospital to Dawlish Community Hospital
- Move day case procedures from Teignmouth Community Hospital into Dawlish Community Hospital
- Continue with a model of community-based intermediate care, reversing the decision to establish 12 rehabilitation beds at Teignmouth Community Hospital